## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS (Boston)

No. 1:23-cv-10511-WGY Vol. 2, Pages 107-159

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al Plaintiffs

vs.

JETBLUE AIRWAYS CORPORATION, et al,

Defendants

\*\*\*\*\*

For Bench Trial Before: Judge William G. Young

United States District Court District of Massachusetts (Boston) One Courthouse Way Boston, Massachusetts 02110 Tuesday, November 14, 2023

\*\*\*\*\*

REPORTER: CHERYL B. PALANCHIAN, RMR, CRR
Official Court Reporter
United States District Court
One Courthouse Way, Boston, MA 02110

## APPEARANCES

EDWARD WILLIAM DUFFY, ESQ. ARIANNA MARKEL, ESQ. AARON TEITELBAUM, ESQ. DOJ-Atr 450 Fifth Street NW, Suite 8000 Washington, DC 20530 (202)812-4723Email: Edward.duffy@usdoj.gov For Plaintiff United States of America - and -WILLIAM T. MATLACK, ESQ. Attorney General's Office One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor Boston, MA 02108 (617)727-2200Email: William.matlack@mass.gov For Plaintiffs United States of America and The Commonwealth of Massachusetts RYAN SHORES, ESQ. Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP 2112 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20037 (202)974-1876Email: Rshores@cgsh.com - and -ELIZABETH M. WRIGHT, ESQ. Cooley LLP 500 Boylston Street Boston, MA 02116-3736 (617)937-2349Email: Ewright@cooley.com - and -RACHEL MOSSMAN ZIEMINSKI, ESQ. MICHAEL MITCHELL, ESQ. Shearman & Sterling LLP 2601 Olive Street, 17th Floor Dallas, TX 75201 (214)271-5777Email: Rachel.zieminski@shearman.com For Defendant JetBlue Airways Corporation (Continued.)

(Continued.) JAY COHEN, ESQ. ANDREW C. FINCH, ESQ. Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison 1285 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10019-6064 (212) 373-3000 Email: Jaycohen@paulweiss.com For Defendant Spirt Airlines, Inc.

INDEX

WITNESS: DIRECT CROSS REDIRECT RECROSS

BARRY BIFFLE, Continued

By Mr. DiMarco 111

DREW WELLS

By Mr. DeRita 121

By Ms. Bansal 151

<u>EXHIBITS</u> <u>PAGE</u>

(Proceedings, 11:25 a.m.) 1 2 THE COURT: Court is in session, please be seated. 3 Mr. Hohler told me that you inquired about the -- be seated, 4 please -- the stenciling on the wall. That, as large 5 aspects of this courtroom, is a nod to historic courtrooms 6 in Massachusetts because stenciling is seen in many of the 7 courtrooms in Massachusetts. And it's cheap. That's why, 8 in public buildings, back then, and I guess now, they use 9 stenciling. The stenciling here is a computer-generated 10 overlay of the arc of the fiberglass wall, which is the 11 signature architectural aspect of the building, laying that 12 arc, one over the other. And then on the courtroom floors, 13 the color code is different. I think on the third floor 14 it's green, here it's blue with red shields, and the like. 15 I delight in talking about the courtroom. But now 16 redirect. 17 MR. DiMARCO: Thank you, your Honor. 18 BARRY BIFFLE, (Resumed) 19 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 20 BY MR. DiMARCO: 21 Mr. Biffle, when you were talking to defense counsel 22 you spoke at length about your growth plans. Frontier has 23 its own growth plans; correct? 24 Α. Yes. 25 And Frontier purchased over 200 aircraft in 2017 and

```
2021 believing there were opportunities to deploy those
 1
 2
     planes on your routes; correct?
 3
     Α.
          Yes.
 4
          And to increase frequency on existing routes; correct?
 5
     Α.
          Yes.
 6
          Frontier decided to purchase those planes before
     Q.
 7
     JetBlue and Spirit entered into the merger agreement;
 8
     correct?
 9
     Α.
          Yes.
10
          In fact, after deciding to enter into the Airbus
11
     contract in 2021, Frontier tried to merge with Spirit;
12
     correct?
13
        Yes.
     Α.
14
          Frontier wanted even more planes with the Spirit
15
     transaction; correct?
               I would think we believed that we needed more at
16
17
     the time, yes.
         And Frontier planned to use all of those planes as a
18
     result of that transaction using the ULCC business model;
19
20
     correct?
               MS. BANSAL: Objection. Beyond the scope.
21
22
               THE COURT: No, I think it's not. Overruled.
23
          I'm sorry, what was the question?
24
               THE COURT: You were going to use those planes in
25
     the ULCC business model?
```

```
THE WITNESS: That is our business model, yes.
 1
 2
          And that would have been over 500 planes, given Spirit
 3
     and Frontier's fleet and order book; correct?
 4
     Α.
          Yes.
 5
          The Court asked you some questions about whether you
 6
     would need to reallocate planes from other routes to use the
 7
     LaGuardia assets. Do you recall that?
 8
          Yes.
     Α.
 9
          And you testified that Frontier could serve the
10
     LaGuardia routes using newly delivered planes; right?
11
     Α.
          Yes.
12
          Frontier would use those planes on other routes if it
13
     didn't have LaGuardia assets; correct?
14
     Α.
          Yes.
15
          And Frontier doesn't currently have enough planes on
16
     order to replace Spirit on all routes Spirit serves today;
17
     correct?
18
          That's correct.
          So Frontier would need to redeploy planes from existing
19
20
     routes to chase most of the opportunities that would be
21
     there if Spirit no longer operated; correct?
22
               MS. BANSAL: Objection.
23
               THE COURT: No, overruled.
24
          Well, it depends upon the moment in time. Right? So
```

when you say the opportunities, right now, Spirit's latest

```
numbers is they -- they -- like, a negative 15. So I don't
 1
 2
     know how many of them are opportunities. It would be
 3
     obviously a subset of their current size. Right? Because
 4
     if they can't be served profitably then they're not really
 5
     an opportunity.
 6
         And you testified that Spirit and Frontier already
 7
     compete on a third of Frontier's routes; correct?
 8
          Yes.
     Α.
 9
               MS. BANSAL: Objection, your Honor. Leading on
10
     redirect.
11
               THE COURT: He is, and it's improper. Don't lead
12
    him. Go ahead.
13
          To what extent, if at all, would you need to compete
14
     with Spirit on the third of those overlap routes if the
15
    merger went through?
16
          I'm sorry --
17
               MS. BANSAL: Objection.
18
               THE COURT: Overruled.
19
          I'm sorry. What do you mean by the question?
20
               THE COURT: Actually, I don't understand it
21
    because if the merger goes through there's not going to be
22
     any Spirit.
23
               MR. DiMARCO: Correct. Yes, correct.
24
               THE COURT: Go ahead.
25
          To the extent you compete today, you would no longer
     Q.
```

```
have to compete with Spirit; correct?
 1
 2
          If they're not there, it would be whatever's left of
 3
     JetBlue. If they pulled out, well then they wouldn't be
 4
     there. I assume that they're going to convert it to
 5
     JetBlue, and we'll be competing with JetBlue. Yeah, that
 6
     third would be completely different than the other
 7
     two-thirds because we're already there. Right? I mean,
 8
     it's not like there's nothing to replace.
 9
          Ms. Bansal showed you both a demonstrative and referred
10
     you to your SEC filings with regard to your order book.
11
     you recall that testimony?
12
     Α.
          Yes.
13
     Q.
          Okay.
14
               MR. DiMARCO: Could we pull up what was
15
     Exhibit 702?
16
          I'm sorry, you said 702?
17
          Yes. It's with the Bates ending 21650.
18
               (On screen.)
19
          And I think your discussion was this was the orders
20
     that you had planned to deliver -- this section at -- on the
21
     page 21650 discussing your order book, this page does not
22
     include the net lease returns; correct?
23
          That's correct.
     Α.
24
          To what extent, if at all, does this page include all
25
     of the deliveries that you're aware of, in the future, of
```

```
the aircraft?
 1
 2
               MS. BANSAL: Objection.
 3
               THE COURT: Overruled.
 4
          These include the ones that we have contracted for.
 5
     mean, there's -- we're in constant negotiations and
 6
     discussions with others, so we could obviously add to this.
 7
     Q.
          Okay.
 8
          But these are the ones that we have contracted for.
 9
          And to what extent does this represent your
10
     understanding as to when those aircraft will actually be
     delivered?
11
12
         As of the end of September, this is what we had
13
     contracted and in some cases received delay notices for.
                                                                So
14
     this is, as we understand it, Airbus' best intention to
     deliver on these periods.
15
          And Ms. Bansal directed you to a sub-bullet in this
16
17
     section, which says, "While the schedule presented reflects
18
     contract delivery dates as of September 30th, 2023, the
19
     company has recently experienced delays in deliveries of
20
     aircraft which may persist in future periods." Correct?
21
          That's right.
     Α.
22
          So they may be delivered -- so it's possible -- is it
23
     possible that there could be future delivery delays relative
24
     to the schedule?
25
               THE COURT: Sustained. You are leading.
```

```
MR. DiMARCO: I apologize, sir.
 1
 2
               THE COURT: Every question is leading. You're not
 3
     to lead on redirect. Is there anything else?
 4
               MR. DiMARCO: A moment to confer.
 5
               (Whereupon counsel conferred.)
 6
          Mr. Biffle, you were shown Biffle Demonstrative 3. On
 7
     this demonstrative how many retirements does Frontier expect
 8
     in the next couple of years?
 9
          Which one's Demonstrative 3? Is it --
     Α.
10
          It's the one with the airplanes on it.
11
          This is the one with all the airplanes across the page?
     Α.
12
          Yep.
     Q.
13
          Okay. I don't know the exact number.
14
          Do you have an estimate as to what they are?
15
          I feel like we're getting hung up on exact orders of
16
     aircraft. And this is -- I'm not trying to be difficult,
17
    but this isn't exactly how the world works. Right? So this
18
     is what we've contracted from Airbus. This can go up or
19
     down. We have huge amounts of flexibility up or down.
20
     can go get more aircraft. We can lease more aircraft, not
     even a direct buy from them. We could get rid of planes.
21
22
          So these are guideposts. What we normally said, I
23
     think the best way to think about our growth is that we have
24
     said we will grow in the 15 to 20 percent range for years to
25
     come based on what we know. If something changes, so in the
```

marketplace if something changes, so a carrier fails, there's a merger that takes place, then we may go find and acquire a big growth, step-function growth in airplanes. So I worry we're getting a little too worried about exactly the number of planes. This can change dramatically based on what the opportunity set is.

THE COURT: Well, the reason that they're doing this, and I appreciate your answer, is because I'm going to have to make a prediction of what will happen whatever I ultimately order. And I guess that's why I was pressing. If this goes through -- and I'll just ask and let you answer. If this goes through, how well are you going to be able to serve your existing routes?

THE WITNESS: I don't think we would ignore our existing routes. I mean, we're not going to take things that we've invested in dramatically and just turn them off to chase something that Spirit flew. Right? Would we look to acquire more aircraft above our normal growth in order to exploit a near-term opportunity? Absolutely. I mean, we would ramp up.

We've looked at, like, for example, like, I could train like three times as many pilots as those I'm currently training. Like, we've looked at what it would take to actually fill a hole or a void if it existed. We don't mind investing in that capacity because I'm going to need it

```
anyway once I get to a particular size. But we wouldn't
 1
     ignore our existing customers. I mean, that would be...
 2
 3
               THE COURT: And another -- and you tell me if I've
 4
     heard you right. I get the sense from your testimony that
 5
     if this merger were to go through it makes good business
 6
     sense, from Frontier's point of view, to serve the gates
 7
     that are divested, which you purchased really, and you think
 8
     you would be up and running within a year of that time, is
 9
     that about right?
10
               THE WITNESS: Are you talking about the LaGuardia
11
     ones?
12
               THE COURT: I guess I am talking about the
13
     LaGuardia.
14
               THE WITNESS: Yeah, the LaGuardia ones, we
     actually would be required, the agreement was that we would
15
16
     do it within six months of closing.
17
               THE COURT: All right.
18
               THE WITNESS: So we would have about eight, I'm
19
     guessing, if this trial --
20
               THE COURT: Well, guessing, you can't guess. You
21
     can estimate.
22
               THE WITNESS: We believe that that is an adequate
23
     amount of time, six months is an adequate amount of time,
24
     and that's why we put it in the agreement.
25
               THE COURT: And the other assets that you would
```

```
get through this?
 1
 2
               THE WITNESS: We haven't contracted for anything
 3
     else beyond LaGuardia. We would be looking. Obviously, we
 4
     would watch what JetBlue does with the assets, like everyone
 5
     will be. We will all be watching every Sunday to see what
 6
     Saturday night's change tape gave us. And I think we would
 7
     start to make maneuvers to fill those voids. And we would,
 8
     so would everybody else in the marketplace.
 9
               THE COURT: Thank you. Mr. DiMarco, go ahead.
10
               MR. DiMARCO: No further questions, your Honor.
11
               THE COURT: Nothing further, Ms. Bansal?
12
               MS. BANSAL: Nothing further.
13
               THE COURT: Thank you. You may step down.
14
               (Whereupon the witness stepped down.)
15
               THE COURT: Call your next witness.
16
               MR. DeRITA: All right. We'll be calling
17
    Mr. Wells.
18
               THE COURT: He may be called.
19
               (Pause in proceedings.)
20
                          DREW WELLS, sworn
21
               THE COURT: Actually, I didn't hear your answer,
22
     sir.
           The court reporter --
23
               THE WITNESS: I do.
24
               THE COURT: Thank you. Please be seated.
25
     pull that microphone. You be comfortable, but pull the
```

```
microphone close to your mouth so it picks you up.
 1
 2
               MR. DeRITA: Good morning, your Honor. I'm Mike
 3
     DeRita with the United States.
 4
               THE COURT: Yes, Mr. DeRita. Go ahead.
 5
                          DIRECT EXAMINATION
 6
     BY MR. DeRITA:
 7
          Mr. Wells, can you state and spell your name, for the
 8
     record?
 9
          Sure. Drew Wells, D-R-E-W, W-E-L-L-S.
     Α.
10
          Where are you currently employed?
     0.
11
          Allegiant Air.
     Α.
12
     Q.
          What's your position there?
13
          Senior vice president and chief revenue officer.
     Α.
14
          And how long have you been in this position?
     Q.
15
          Oh, almost a year.
     Α.
          What are your responsibilities at Allegiant?
16
17
          Generally, anything revenue-related, network planning,
18
     kind of a lot of the commercial functions excluding
19
    marketing.
20
          Can you give some more color as to what that means with
21
     respect to network planning?
22
          The network planning team decides where we fly, how
23
     often we fly, the schedule, locations of our crew and
24
     aircraft bases.
```

And with respect to revenue management, can you give us

- 1 | some more detail on that?
- 2 A. Sure. Pricing all air tickets, as well as our
- 3 ancillary and third-party products that we offer.
- 4 | Q. As part of your role at Allegiant, are you familiar
- 5 | with the operations of other airlines?
- 6 A. Somewhat, yes.
- 7 Q. And how are you familiar with those operations?
- 8 A. Sorry. Can you --
- 9 Q. What types of things do you read or follow that allow
- 10 you to stay familiar with operations of other airlines?
- 11 A. Generally aware of, you know, industry media and public
- 12 schedule data that allows me to keep up on network
- 13 decisions, schedules, capacity, things of that nature.
- 14 Q. How long have you been at Allegiant in total?
- 15 A. About twelve and a half years.
- 16 Q. What other positions have you held at Allegiant?
- 17 A. Started in financial planning and analysis, worked in
- 18 | the fleet planning group, then spent the last decade,
- 19 really, with the revenue team.
- 20 Q. Now, I'll have more questions for you about this later,
- 21 | but I'd like to just briefly discuss divestitures. But as a
- 22 general matter, has Allegiant agreed to purchase Spirit and
- 23 JetBlue assets that will be divested in relation to the
- 24 JetBlue-Spirit merger?
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. At which airports?
- 2 A. Fort Lauderdale, Boston Logan and Newark.
- 3 Q. Were you involved in Allegiant's discussions with
- 4 JetBlue to purchase those assets?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And what was your role with respect to those
- 7 negotiations?
- 8 A. I was generally the primary point of contact with
- 9 Allegiant.
- 10 | Q. Okay. I'd like to turn and discuss Allegiant's
- 11 business model and its position in the industry. Starting
- 12 | there, how would you describe Allegiant?
- 13 A. Allegiant is an ultra low-cost carrier. We pride
- 14 ourselves on keeping fixed costs low that enable us to
- 15 deploy capacity in a way that matches with the level of
- 16 demand we foresee in the marketplace.
- 17 | Q. How does Allegiant keep fixed costs low?
- 18 A. Generally, through our aircraft acquisition tactics.
- 19 Q. Can you explain what you mean by that?
- 20 A. Sure. Historically, Allegiant has operated a used
- 21 aircraft fleet that's been, you know, a low-cost point to us
- 22 to put into service. As we moved forward, we do have a new
- 23 order of Boeing MAXs that we're very proud of the economics
- 24 behind that deal as well.
- 25 Q. How would you describe Allegiant's airport costs?

- 1 A. Typically lower through airport selection, but not
- 2 always.
- 3 Q. What do you mean by that?
- 4 A. If we go to LAX, we may not have any different cost
- 5 structure than another airline such as JetBlue or Spirit.
- 6 If we're in Grand Island, Nebraska, obviously we have a fair
- 7 bit of a different setup.
- 8 Q. Does Allegiant seek to serve lower-cost airports?
- 9 A. Where it makes sense, yes.
- 10 | Q. And what airports typically are lower-cost?
- 11 A. Secondary or less well-served airports.
- 12 Q. How would you describe Allegiant's seating density?
- 13 A. Not quite at max capacity, as our ideal state, but
- 14 close to it.
- 15 Q. Is there any relationship between Allegiant seating
- 16 density and its costs?
- 17 A. On a unitized basis, but actually more expensive on a
- 18 | trip cost.
- 19 Q. How would you compare Allegiant's cost structure to
- 20 | Spirit's?
- MR. BANSAL: Objection. Foundation.
- THE COURT: Do you think you're able to answer
- 23 | that question?
- 24 THE WITNESS: Generally so, yes.
- 25 THE COURT: And I'll accept his answer

```
understanding that it's general. How would you compare it?
 1
 2
               THE WITNESS: Allegiant's cost structure on the
     unitized basis is slightly higher than Spirit's because we
 3
 4
     fly less often, generally.
 5
          When you say less often, on what basis are you
 6
     referring to?
 7
          The number of hours per aircraft per day, what we'd
     call utilization.
 8
          How would you quantify the difference in utilization
 9
10
     that you're describing?
11
          Sure. Spirit will tend to fly roughly 12 hours per
12
     aircraft per day at a high level, Allegiant is closer to six
13
     or seven hours per day.
14
         How would you compare Allegiant's cost structure to
15
     JetBlue's?
         Allegiant would be lower than JetBlue's.
16
17
          How would you compare Allegiant's cost structure to
18
     other ULCCs, setting aside Spirit?
19
               MS. BANSAL: Objection. Foundation.
20
               THE COURT: If he thinks he can answer it we'll
21
     receive his answer.
22
          The answer would be similar to Spirit's in that we fly
23
     a little bit less and, therefore, our unitized costs are
24
     slightly higher.
```

Okay. I'd like to turn to discuss Allegiant's network

- strategy. At a high level how would you describe
  Allegiant's network strategy?
- A. Allegiant is attempting to serve underserved or unserved routes where folks don't have an option or are priced out of the ability to travel.
- 6 Q. What do you mean by underserved or unserved routes?
- A. Unserved is kind of how it seems. There's no current options between points A and B. Underserved would mean there is service but it's generally higher priced and pricing out some element of the demand that exists.
- 11 Q. How would you describe Allegiant's destinations in 12 terms of city size?
- A. Pretty broad array from more sun destinations, like
  Orlando and Las Vegas, to some of the largest metropolitan
  areas like Newark, Boston and others.
  - Q. Is there a city size that's more prevalent within Allegiant's network, typically?

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- A. Given that we started with a smaller size strategy, that's a bit more prevalent today. But the evolution of the network has been such that we have all been more midsized cities through the midpart of the last decade, and then to some of the largest cities kind of within the last five to six years.
- Q. I'd like to turn your attention to a document that is in the binder in front of you. It's Exhibit 10. It's

```
already in evidence.
 1
 2
               (On screen.)
 3
          And just let me know when you're open to that page.
 4
     We'll stay right on the first page here. What is this
 5
     document?
 6
          It appears to be an e-mail from me to our chief
 7
     marketing officer and our former -- well, she was over
 8
     flight ops and moved into more of a customer experience type
 9
     of role.
10
          Okay. I'd like to direct your attention to the
11
     paragraph that has a number 1 in front of it.
12
               MS. BANSAL: Objection. Sorry to interrupt you.
13
     Objection. He hasn't laid a business foundation.
14
               THE COURT: It's in evidence, Exhibit 10.
15
               MS. BANSAL: It is in evidence but I believe he's
     using it in an improper way.
16
17
               THE COURT: I don't.
18
     Q.
          Do you need me to redirect you?
19
          Something about bullet point 1.
20
          Yeah. So if we can go to bullet point 1, here you
21
     write with focus on the "pillar/built to be different"
22
     pieces. What are you referring to by "pillar/built to be
23
     different pieces"?
24
          The "built to be different" has been a staple of our
25
     management presentations and external communication really
```

since the inception of the company. 1

- How, if at all, does Allegiant consider the "built to be different pieces" in its strategy?
- The way I consider it, and probably why I use pillars here is this is how we think about, you know, the core of 5
- 6 our service. So underserved markets is as we described
- 7 before. Leisure customers, our frequency does not lend
- 8 itself well to business customers, and so on. If there's a
- 9 specific point I'm happy to talk to it.
- 10 Yeah, so let's go through some of them. First let's
- 11 talk about the leisure customer. You sort of already
- 12 discussed it, but can you explain by what is meant by
- 13 leisure customer being included in this set of pillars?
- 14 This is generally a customer going on vacation or
- 15 visiting friends and relatives. Because our frequency is
- 16 often less than daily, it doesn't work well for a more
- 17 schedule-centric traveler, which a business customer usually
- 18 is.

2

3

- To what extent does Allegiant focus its business on 19
- 20 serving those types of leisure customers?
- 21 Historically, a hundred percent of our efforts go
- 22 toward that.
- 23 And you mentioned the frequency with which Allegiant
- 24 serves being less than daily. How would you describe the
- 25 number of times a week that Allegiant typically provides

1 service?

- 2 A. Typically, we try to match the capacity with the level
- 3 of demand that exists. For some parts of the year that can
- 4 | be daily or more, and in many parts and more than 50 percent
- 5 of the time it tends to be two times a week.
- 6 Q. How often does Allegiant provide daily service on a
- 7 route?
- 8 A. Over the last 12 months, 58 routes have had daily or
- 9 more service.
- 10 | Q. And how many routes has Allegiant served total?
- 11 A. Approximately 550.
- 12 Q. So I'm a lawyer, don't really love math, but that's
- 13 | about 10 percent?
- 14 A. Ballpark, that works.
- 15 Q. If we move down the list here, I believe you already
- 16 described underserved markets, but there's an entry here
- 17 | with "little competition." What is that a reference to?
- 18 A. That's really a reference to unserved or underserved
- 19 markets. There is a lot of demand that exists, especially
- 20 | in the leisure space, that we don't believe is being
- 21 satisfied broadly by the industry. That's led to a lot of
- 22 opportunities for us where there may or may not be existing
- 23 | industry competition or service.
- 24 Q. How does Allegiant use this pillar of "little
- 25 competition" in its network planning capacity?

- 1 A. We use it to understand what the dynamics of the
- 2 | marketplace are. We couldn't make a call on what's
- 3 underserved without knowing the number of seats, the number
- 4 of passengers or the yields being produced by routes. This
- 5 | is all generally available public information but it is not
- 6 a binary yes or no there is or is not competition, therefore
- 7 | we should or should not serve.
- 8 Q. To what extent, if at all, does Allegiant seek out
- 9 routes with little competition?
- 10 A. We seek out routes that we believe have opportunity for
- 11 us. And whether or not they have competition, like I said,
- 12 it's not a binary decision or an end state there, but rather
- 13 | an influence on whether or not we believe there is demand to
- 14 be stimulated on that market.
- 15 Q. How many of Allegiant's routes is Allegiant the only
- 16 | airline that provides service?
- 17 A. Using the definition that we do, which would include a
- 18 | single proxy airport but not double proxy airports, and no
- 19 regional jet service, we have -- out of the 550 routes, 124
- 20 have competition, the balance would not.
- 21 Q. So, again, trying to do the math here, that would mean
- 22 about 75 percent of the routes that Allegiant serves do not
- 23 have competition?
- 24 A. Correct.
- $25 \mid Q$ . And how does that 75 percent or so compare to the level

- of competition on routes that Allegiant has identified in its forward-looking network strategy?
- A. As of today, we think the forward-looking is approximately the same.

8

18

19

table here?

- Q. Let's move down the list to the "low frequency/variable capacity." We've talked about capacity and frequency a little bit, but how would you explain this entry in the
- 9 A. Very much how I did before. We aim to match the level
  10 of capacity we deploy with the amount of demand we foresee
  11 in the market. That's going to be different in a July than,
  12 say, a September.
- 13 Q. Why would it be different in July versus September?
- 14 A. I'm guessing if we polled the room, many more people 15 take vacation --
- THE COURT: I always jump in when you use the word
  "guess." You can estimate, but you can't guess.
  - A. I'm sorry. I estimate if we polled the room, more folks here would take vacation in July than in September.
- 20 As we focus on the leisure customer, that's the demand we 21 focus on.
- 22 Q. Does Allegiant vary its capacity based on route?
- A. Based on the level of demand we forecast for any given route, yes.
- 25 | Q. And does Allegiant vary its frequency based on the day

- 1 of the week?
- 2 A. Certainly. Again, as the leisure customer's demand
- 3 profile is very weekend heavy, typically, and less so on a
- 4 Tuesday or Wednesday, for example.
- 5 Q. Okay. I'd like to turn to some specific questions
- 6 about Allegiant's network and how it uses its fleet. Where
- 7 do Allegiant's planes typically park overnight?
- 8 A. We have 24 crew and aircraft bases around the system
- 9 and all of our aircraft and crew should rest overnight
- 10 there.
- 11 Q. Are you familiar with the term "out and back"?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. What does that mean to you?
- 14 A. For us, in our network, that would mean a crew and
- 15 | aircraft departing a base, going out to one of our
- 16 outstations, and then returning immediately to the domicile
- 17 | in which it started.
- 18 Q. Does Allegiant operate an out-and-back network?
- 19 A. Predominantly, yes.
- 20 Q. When you say "predominantly," how frequent would it be
- 21 | that the service is out and back?
- 22 A. More than probably 90 percent of the time out and back.
- 23 Q. Are you familiar with the term "fortress hub"?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. What are they?

- 1 A. To me, fortress hub means, predominantly for a legacy
- 2 carrier, a place where many of their spoke routes will
- 3 | terminate to create connection opportunities to their
- 4 thicker routes at an airport that they heavily dominate in
- 5 terms of level of service.
- 6 Q. Does Allegiant serve other airlines' fortress hubs?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 0. Which ones?
- 9 A. Newark, for example, would be a fortress for United.
- 10 We serve adjacent to other fortress hubs. For example, we
- 11 serve Midway in Chicago adjacent to the O'Hare fortress hub
- 12 for, again, United. We're here in Boston. We serve both
- 13 Dulles and Baltimore in the DC area. Houston.
- 14 Q. Does Allegiant serve -- provide service to Atlanta?
- 15 A. Atlanta will be one of the few, along with Dallas, of
- 16 the kind of fortress metros that we do not serve. I believe
- 17 we serve all of the others.
- 18 Q. But on an airport-to-airport basis, which fortress hubs
- 19 does Allegiant serve?
- 20 A. On a specific airport basis?
- 21 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. Dulles, Newark, Boston. If we're including Southwest
- 23 in this, Houston Hobby and Midway, Minneapolis, Denver,
- 24 Portland, if you count that for Alaska, LAX.
- 25 Q. Does Allegiant serve Atlanta Airport on an

- airport-to-airport basis? 1 2 We do not serve Atlanta or the region. 3 Does Allegiant serve O'Hare Chicago on an Q. 4 airport-to-airport basis? 5 O'Hare, no. Α. 6 Dallas-Fort Worth on an airport-to-airport basis? Q. Not Dallas nor the region. 7 Α. Does Spirit serve other airlines' fortress hubs? 8 Q. 9 MS. BANSAL: Objection, foundation. 10 THE COURT: No, I think he's demonstrated a level 11 of knowledge. I can accept that testimony. It all will go 12 to the weight. 13 Yes, they do. Α. 14 Which fortress hubs does Spirit serve that Allegiant 15 does not? I certainly don't know that I'll have a full list for 16 17 you. I presume, based on the line of questioning, they 18 serve Atlanta and they serve Dallas-Fort Worth. 19 Good guess. Does Allegiant currently provide international service? 20 21 We have an application out to do so. It is in the 22 government's hands. If you could please talk with your 23 colleagues and get that through. We would have been serving
  - Q. And can you just explain more about what that

in January of this year. Appreciate it.

24

application is for? 1 2 Sure. It was an antitrust immunity and joint venture 3 with Viva Aerobus in Mexico. The intention was that we 4 would be able to collaborate and serve transborder between 5 the U.S. and Mexico together, yeah, fully cooperatively. 6 Whose metal would that service be provided on? Ο. 7 It would be a mix. It would be metal neutral, with the 8 estimate that it would be close to 50/50. 9 THE COURT: The metal neutral, which means equal 10 number of planes? 11 THE WITNESS: Meaning for the consumer it would be 12 indifferent. It could be Allegiant one day, it could be 13 Viva Aerobus the next day. There was no prescribed, from 14 the city, it must be X airline. 15 Does Allegiant provide any international service on an independent basis? 16 17 Not today, no. Α. 18 And has Allegiant attempted to do so in the past? 19 Α. Twice, yes. 20 Why does Allegiant not provide that service? 21 The first time we had put application in with the 22 Mexican government it became very cumbersome from a 23 development, IT-development perspective, and we decided that 24 it was not in our best interests to continue going down that

path. The second time a global pandemic struck and we

- 1 stopped progress.
- 2 Q. Does Allegiant currently provide service to Puerto
- 3 Rico?
- 4 A. No, not currently.
- 5 Q. Has Allegiant provided service to Puerto Rico in the
- 6 past?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Why did Allegiant stop providing Puerto Rican service?
- 9 A. Puerto Rico was well served and the results weren't
- 10 great for us at that time so we ceased service.
- 11 Q. What do you mean by "well served"?
- 12 A. There's a high number of fairly low-fare seats that
- 13 entered that marketplace to a place that we no longer felt
- 14 it was underserved and producing results we had hoped for.
- 15 Q. Does Allegiant currently sell tickets for connecting
- 16 service?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 Q. Okay. I want to change the topic here and talk about
- 19 the way that you compete with other airlines. How would you
- 20 describe the current competition, if any, between JetBlue
- 21 and Allegiant?
- 22 A. Only on a handful of routes.
- 23 Q. Did you have a specific number?
- 24 A. I believe it's -- I believe it's less than ten.
- 25 Q. How would you compare Allegiant's business model to

Spirit's? 1 2 Similar from a ultra low-cost carrier perspective but 3 different thoughts on how we deploy capacity. 4 Can you expand a little bit more on that, about the 5 difference on deployment capacity? 6 Sure. We believe that, being Allegiant, we should Α. 7 deploy capacity when demand exists. And I believe Spirit 8 believes they should deploy capacity in a way that minimizes 9 unit cost regardless of the demand environment. 10 I guess can you put that into more practical terms as 11 to how that would play out in the deployment of the 12 capacity? 13 MS. BANSAL: Objection. 14 THE COURT: I didn't understand that question. understood his answer to the previous question. 15 16 All right. Can you give --17 THE COURT: They serve demand, Spirit uses other calculations. 18 19 Can you give an example of where that might be the 20 case? 21 I would look at the number of times that Allegiant 22 serves a two- or three-time-a-week market because that's 23 where we believe the level of demand exists, relative to 24 Spirit not flying very many of those and likely flying empty 25 airplanes on some days a week.

```
How would you compare Allegiant's fleet size to
 1
 2
     Spirit's?
 3
          I don't know Spirit's fleet number, off the top of my
     head. Allegiant has approximately 125 aircraft.
 4
 5
          And how would you compare the number of destinations
 6
     that Spirit serves to the number that Allegiant serves?
 7
     Α.
          Allegiant serves more destinations than Spirit does.
 8
     We should be third overall in the industry for that.
 9
          How would you compare the number of times --
10
               THE COURT: Third -- excuse me. Third among ultra
11
     low-cost carriers?
12
               THE WITNESS: No. Into the pandemic we actually
13
     served more domestic cities than any other airline,
14
     including legacies. American and Delta, as they've gone to
15
     main-line service on the bigger aircraft to some of the
     smaller cities, have passed us. But it's third among all in
16
17
     the U.S. industry.
18
               THE COURT: Thank you.
19
          When you say "served," do you mean year-round or is
20
     that a seasonal basis?
21
     Α.
          It could be either.
22
          How would you compare the number of times per week that
23
     Allegiant serves its routes versus Spirit?
24
          I don't have Spirit's, off the top of my head.
```

believe the vast majority are served at least daily.

Whereas, as we discussed, more of ours are served less than 1 2 daily. 3 I'd like to return to a topic I previewed earlier, the 4 divestitures. First, let's discuss at a high level how 5 these assets would actually be transferred to Allegiant. 6 And just to start, I want to talk about gates and ground 7 facilities, not authorizations or anything like that. 8 What approvals, if any, are required to transfer the 9 assets at Boston, Fort Lauderdale and Newark to Allegiant? 10 We would need the airport or airport authority to 11 approve that, as well as the merger to go through. 12 Has Allegiant obtained those consents from the airport 13 authorities for the transfers that we were just discussing? 14 Not at present, no. Α. 15 Has Allegiant been involved in discussions with the 16 airport authorities to obtain those consents? 17 Somewhat, yes. Α. 18 Okay. And I want to switch and talk about the 19 operating authorizations at Newark. So when I say 20 "operating authorizations," are you aware of what I'm 21 referring to? 22 I presume runway authorizations, landing and departure 23 pairs. 24 And Allegiant is purchasing operating authorizations at

Newark; is that right?

- 1 A. Correct.
- 2 Q. Okay. Is any authorization required to transfer the
- 3 operating authorizations from Spirit to Allegiant at Newark?
- 4 A. My understanding is the FAA would have to get involved
- 5 | with that.
- 6 Q. Has that consent been obtained from the FAA yet?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. How, if at all, did the need to obtain consent from the
- 9 airport authorities and the FAA impact the price Allegiant
- 10 offered for the divestiture assets?
- 11 A. Sorry. Was that for the FAA or in general?
- 12 Q. In general.
- 13 A. It impacted it meaningfully. We reduced the price
- 14 roughly in half.
- 15 Q. When you say -- did you say decreased the price roughly
- 16 in half? I wasn't quite clear.
- 17 A. Correct. Yeah, the price came down by about
- 18 50 percent.
- 19 Q. Okay. And I'd like to walk through the three
- 20 divestiture airports and we'll start with Boston. What
- 21 assets has Allegiant agreed to purchase in Boston?
- 22 A. Two gates, along with support to run those gates.
- 23 Q. Does the divestiture agreement include any planes?
- 24 A. No.
- 25 Q. Does it include any pilots?

- 1 A. No.
- 2 Q. Does it include any other flight crew or employees?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. Putting aside the divestiture, has Allegiant attempted
- 5 to obtain preferential gates at Boston in the past?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. And what happened in those attempts?
- 8 A. We did not get them.
- 9 Q. Do you have any understanding as to why?
- 10 A. I do not.
- 11 Q. Let's talk about Boston's -- Allegiant's current
- 12 service in Boston. In your binder you have a demonstrative
- 13 | labeled Wells Demonstrative A, and it's also going to appear
- 14 on the screen in front of you. And just let me know when
- 15 you're there.
- (On screen.)
- 17 A. Okay.
- 18 | Q. So this is a screenshot of Allegiant's route map, and
- 19 it's been filtered to Boston. It came directly from your
- 20 website. You can see the URL there at the top.
- Does this look like an accurate list of Allegiant's
- 22 | Boston routes to you, Mr. Wells?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 \ Q. And it's a little bit hard to kind of make out with all
- 25 the colors and lines here so I just want to walk through

```
When we get to the others we'll assume it's all the
 1
 2
     same.
 3
          So the lines here on this map, they would indicate the
     routes from Boston Logan to the destinations that are being
 4
 5
     served; is that right?
 6
          Correct.
     Α.
 7
          And the green dots are the other endpoints of the
 8
     Boston service; is that right?
 9
          Correct.
     Α.
10
          And on the right-hand side here there's actually a list
11
     of the destinations spelled out by name; is that right?
12
     Α.
          Yes.
13
          Okay. How would you describe the destinations that
14
     Allegiant currently serves to and from Boston?
15
          Cities that have demand to Boston. They range from
16
     more mid-continent, perhaps origination cities that use
17
     Boston as a destination, as well as some sun destinations in
18
     the south that would originate a bit more from Boston.
19
          How would you characterize the traffic and passengers
20
     on these routes?
21
          Sorry. In what manner?
     Α.
22
          For what reason are the travelers typically traveling
23
     on these routes?
24
               MS. BANSAL: Objection.
25
               THE COURT: Overruled.
```

- 1 A. Leisure, generally.
- 2 Q. And as far as the size of the cities that Boston serves
- 3 | from -- that Allegiant serves from Boston, how would you
- 4 | characterize those?
- 5 A. Mostly midsized cities or sun destinations.
- 6 Q. Why does Allegiant serve leisure customers in midsized
- 7 destinations from Boston?
- 8 A. Because they aren't being served properly by the rest
- 9 of the industry.
- 10 Q. And what do you mean by that?
- 11 A. There's not enough seats to satisfy the level of demand
- 12 that we believe exists, especially at the price point we're
- 13 | willing to offer.
- 14 Q. Does Allegiant currently compete with JetBlue on any of
- 15 its Boston routes?
- 16 A. I believe they announced Asheville, and certainly to
- 17 | Sarasota.
- 18 | Q. Is there any difference between Allegiant's strategy
- 19 for its Boston routes and your understanding of the service
- 20 | that JetBlue provides at Boston?
- 21 A. Sorry. Can you repeat?
- 22 | Q. Yeah. Is there a difference between the way we've been
- 23 talking about Allegiant's strategy for Boston and the
- 24 service that JetBlue provides at Boston, the cities and the
- 25 types of passengers?

```
I can certainly speak to Allegiant. You know, like I
 1
 2
     said, we're attempting to serve a leisure customer either
 3
     out of or into Boston that's not currently being served in a
 4
     way that we feel the demand dictates. But I would also like
 5
     to point out that we're fairly pigeonholed in Boston using
 6
     international gates from midmorning until early afternoon.
 7
     Our capability to grow beyond this is severely hindered by
 8
     that inability to gain a preferential gate.
 9
          Okay. Let's talk about Allegiant's plans for the
10
     Boston divestiture assets. Does the divestiture agreement
11
     obligate Allegiant to serve the routes that Spirit currently
12
     serves in Boston?
13
          Does the divestiture agreement dictate that?
14
          Yes, sir.
     Q.
15
          No.
     Α.
          Has Allegiant developed plans for which routes it will
16
17
     serve using the Boston assets?
18
          It's a fluid environment. We can certainly make calls
19
     based on what we know historically on the day that it
20
     exists, but I'm not in the business of speculating what may
21
     happen when the merger closes and what demand may look like.
22
                 I'm not asking you to speculate. I guess let me
     Q.
          Sure.
23
     put a finer point on it. Are there any concrete plans, like
24
     having a list of routes that -- and frequencies that
25
     Allegiant would serve in Boston should it acquire the
```

1 divestiture assets?

- 2 A. No. I'm not going to try to speculate what may happen
- 3 with capacity and yields far to the future when this merger
- 4 | may or may not occur. So it wouldn't be practical for me to
- 5 say what the network will look like then.
- 6 Q. So no such list exists today?
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 Q. Okay. Let's shift and talk about Newark. What assets
- 9 has Allegiant agreed to purchase in Newark?
- 10 A. Similarly, the two gates as well as the runway
- 11 authorizations.
- 12 Q. Does Allegiant plan to use all of the Newark operating
- 13 | authorizations it's acquired?
- 14 A. We'll certainly attempt to. I'll admit some are more
- 15 challenging for us to use than others.
- 16 Q. Why would that be the case that they would be more
- 17 | challenging?
- 18 A. We don't currently base any crew or aircraft in Newark,
- 19 so hitting the earliest time frames are a challenge.
- 20 Q. Okay. I'm going to introduce Wells Demonstrative C
- 21 and, yes, I'm going out of order here. But it will look
- 22 very similar to the route map that we discussed earlier but
- 23 this one has been filtered to Newark. And it's also from
- 24 | Allegiant's website.
- 25 (On screen.)

- 1 Q. Does this look like an accurate list of Allegiant's
- 2 Newark routes to you, Mr. Wells?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. And we had just explained and discussed that Allegiant
- 5 serves smaller leisure destinations from Boston. Does
- 6 Allegiant serve those same types of customers to and from
- 7 Newark?
- 8 A. Yeah. Generally, midsized cities and sun destinations.
- 9 Q. Does Allegiant currently compete with JetBlue on any of
- 10 | its Newark routes?
- 11 A. I don't believe so.
- 12 Q. Has Allegiant developed plans for which routes it will
- 13 serve using the Newark assets?
- 14 A. I can't speculate what will happen with capacity and
- 15 yields into the future.
- 16 Q. Okay. We can pull that one down. And I'd like to move
- 17 to the last of the three divestiture airports, Fort
- 18 | Lauderdale. What assets has Allegiant agreed to purchase in
- 19 Fort Lauderdale?
- 20 A. Five gates.
- 21 Q. So putting aside the divestiture, has Allegiant
- 22 attempted to acquire gates at Fort Lauderdale?
- 23 A. We have.
- 24 Q. And has Allegiant acquired -- has Allegiant faced any
- 25 difficulties in obtaining preferential gates at Fort

Lauderdale? 1 2 Fort Lauderdale requires that you fit an extra gate 3 worth of service onto your existing footprint in order to 4 qualify for an incremental gate. So it's a bit slower in 5 nature to accomplish that. 6 So has Allegiant been able to do that? 0. 7 Α. Yes. 8 THE COURT: How many gates do you have at Fort 9 Lauderdale? 10 THE WITNESS: Three gates currently. 11 Has Allegiant faced any gate constraints at Fort Q. 12 Lauderdale? 13 Certainly. Α. 14 How so? Ο. 15 We would like to have more gates than they are 16 currently offering us. 17 Okay. And I'd like to talk about Allegiant's current 18 service at Fort Lauderdale. I'm going to introduce Wells 19 Demonstrative B. And, again, this is another screenshot 20 from the Allegiant website, and this one actually appears on 21 two pages. So if we can actually get those side by side. 22 (On screen.) 23 The map itself is exactly the same and this would be 24 the right-hand side with the list. And does this look like

an accurate list of Allegiant's Fort Lauderdale routes to

25

```
you, Mr. Wells?
 1
 2
          Yes.
 3
          And does Allegiant serve the same types of passengers
 4
     that we described at Boston and Newark out of Fort
 5
     Lauderdale?
 6
          Obviously, Fort Lauderdale being a bit more sun
 7
     destination, it's not quite the same as Boston or Fort
 8
     Lauderdale. But, generally, a leisure customer a bit more
 9
     inbound than you would see, but otherwise yes.
10
          And as far as city size, how would you describe the
11
     city size that Allegiant serves to and from Fort Lauderdale?
12
          Predominantly midsized with some small and an
13
     occasional large city.
14
          Does Allegiant currently compete with JetBlue on any of
15
     its Fort Lauderdale routes?
          I believe so but I don't know for sure, off the top of
16
17
     my head.
18
          Recognizing that you don't know, is there a number of
19
     routes that you think might be competition between JetBlue
     and Fort Lauderdale there?
20
21
               MS. BANSAL: Objection. He said he doesn't know.
22
               THE COURT: Sustained.
23
          Has Allegiant developed plans for which routes it will
24
     serve using the Fort Lauderdale assets?
```

Along the same lines. I can't speculate what may

25

Α.

```
happen with capacity and yields into the future so it would
 1
 2
     be hard to do.
 3
          Okay. And, finally, I just want to take a step back
     and discuss Allegiant's future plans more generally, not
 4
     just the three divestiture assets. Are there any concrete
 5
 6
     plans for Allegiant's network strategy of serving small
 7
     leisure -- end leisure markets to change if Allegiant
 8
     acquires the divestiture assets?
          Our focus is on serving unserved and underserved routes
 9
10
     which, over time, has evolved to mean more than just small
11
     and midsized cities. So I would expect everything is fair
12
     game, including international.
13
         Are there any concrete plans for those things to
14
     change?
15
         No. It's a fluid industry.
     Α.
     Q. And earlier you mentioned that 75 percent of
16
17
     Allegiant's routes have no competition. Did Allegiant
    believe the fact that it doesn't offer -- that it doesn't
18
     often compete with other carriers would make it an
19
20
     attractive divestiture buyer?
21
               MS. BANSAL: Objection.
22
               THE COURT: Sustained. You're leading the
23
     witness.
24
         Are there any concrete plans for Allegiant to change
```

the frequency with which it faces competition if Allegiant

25

acquires the divestiture assets? 1 2 Our plan remains to match capacity with demand. Such 3 that minimum-use requirements exist, we have every bit of 4 faith that we will meet those. I'm not sure that I was actually clear on the question. 5 6 So going back on the number that we were talking about, 7 75 percent of Allegiant's routes don't face competition, are 8 there any concrete plans for Allegiant to change how often 9 it faces competition if Allegiant acquires the divestiture 10 assets? 11 Our plan is to serve un- and underserved routes where 12 we think it makes sense that there's a demand profile not 13 properly being served. So whether it has competition or not 14 is kind of indifferent. It's about what exists on that 15 market. THE COURT: You said it would be challenging to 16 17 serve Newark where you were going to get some gates. How 18 challenging will it be to serve Fort Lauderdale? 19 THE WITNESS: Well, maybe for a point of 20 clarification, challenging to hit the earliest time slots of 21 the runway authorization, not challenging in general. 22 THE COURT: I'll take your refinement and I 23 appreciate it. 24 THE WITNESS: Fort Lauderdale, we've had no issue 25 and continue to grow gates. I have every bit of confidence

```
that we can serve five additional gates with an ever
 1
 2
     expanding network. And after counselor speaks with his
 3
     colleagues, our international service transborder as well.
               MR. DeRITA: We're the DOJ, we're not the DOD or
 4
 5
     the FAA.
 6
               I have no further questions at this time. I'll
 7
     pass the witness.
 8
               THE COURT: Ms. Bansal, any questions for this
 9
     witness?
10
               MS. BANSAL: I do, your Honor.
11
               THE COURT: You may.
12
                           CROSS-EXAMINATION
13
    BY MS. BANSAL:
14
          Good morning, Mr. Wells.
15
    A. Good afternoon.
16
     Q. Good afternoon. Are we there yet?
17
          Allegiant is a ULCC that has been quickly growing over
     time; correct?
18
19
    Α.
         Correct.
          And part of Allegiant's business model is to constantly
20
21
    monitor opportunities for growth; correct?
22
    Α.
          Correct.
23
          And in doing so, you often look at routes in which
24
     other airlines have dropped capacity; correct?
25
          Correct.
     Α.
```

- 1 Q. And that would include routes in which Spirit has
- 2 dropped capacity; correct?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. In looking for opportunities you will also look for
- 5 routes where fares increased; is that fair?
- 6 A. Uhm-hmm. Yes.
- 7 Q. Now, as you just discussed with the Department of
- 8 Justice, Allegiant is a divestiture buyer in this merger;
- 9 right?
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 Q. You've signed agreements to acquire assets in three
- 12 | airports; correct?
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 Q. And do you agree, sir, that those assets will increase
- 15 your ability to compete out of Boston, Newark and Fort
- 16 Lauderdale?
- 17 A. Certainly.
- 18 Q. And it will increase your flexibility to grow out of
- 19 those airports; correct?
- 20 A. Correct.
- 21 Q. If you could turn, Mr. Wells, to Exhibit BUY. This
- 22 would be in the binder. I think you're in the right binder.
- (On screen.)
- 24 Q. Just let me know when you have it up.
- 25 A. Yep, we're good.

```
Now, this is Allegiant's management presentation from
 1
     Q.
     the second quarter of 2023; correct?
 2
 3
     Α.
          Yes.
 4
          And you're familiar with this presentation?
 5
          Generally so, yes.
    Α.
 6
          You're part of Allegiant's management?
     Q.
 7
    Α.
          Correct.
 8
               MS. BANSAL: I'd like to introduce BUY into
 9
     evidence.
10
               MR. DeRITA: Objection. Hearsay.
11
               THE COURT: It is.
12
               MS. BANSAL: It's a business record, your Honor.
13
               THE COURT: You haven't laid a foundation for it,
14
    but I assume that it is. So it's a business record. Is it
15
     relevant?
16
               MS. BANSAL: I believe so, yes.
17
               THE COURT: Well, how so?
18
               MS. BANSAL: This shows the -- this shows
19
     Allegiant's growth plans over the next few years, it shows
20
     its network map, it shows its performance in the industry,
21
     and that it's a quickly growing ULCC.
22
               THE COURT: You don't challenge that it's really a
23
    business record of Allegiant's, do you?
24
               MR. DeRITA: Well, I'm not sure exactly how
25
     counsel plans to use it and for what statements within this
```

```
document, but it's still hearsay.
 1
 2
               THE COURT: Well, we'll see. And if you have a
 3
     valid objection I'll hear you. BUY is admitted and the next
 4
     number will be 7-0 what?
 5
               COUNSEL: Six.
 6
               THE COURT: Six, in evidence.
 7
               (Exhibit 706 received in evidence.)
 8
          If you could turn, Mr. Wells, to the Bates ending in
 9
     3230. Now, Mr. Wells, this is a map of Allegiant's route
10
     network as of June 2023. Does that look accurate to you?
11
     Α.
         Yes.
12
         And I believe you testified to this earlier, but if you
13
     could remind the Court, how many routes does Allegiant serve
14
     today?
15
          It's approximately 550 today, down from the 572 here in
     the document.
16
17
          How many passengers does Allegiant serve?
     Q.
18
     A. Seventeen to 18 million annually.
          And I think you testified to this too, but just as a
19
20
     reminder to the Court, how many airports does Allegiant
21
     serve?
22
          There's approximately between 120, 125.
23
          And I think you testified earlier, that is the third
24
     highest of all domestic airlines; is that correct?
25
          Domestically, yes.
     Α.
```

- 1 Q. How does Allegiant's airport presence compare with
- 2 | Spirit's?
- 3 A. I don't know the Spirit number, off the top of my head,
- 4 | but I know that Allegiant's is larger.
- 5 Q. Would approximately double sound right to you?
- 6 A. I could believe it.
- 7 Q. And you testified earlier that you have 24 bases;
- 8 | correct?
- 9 A. Correct.
- 10 | Q. And included in these bases are ground crew, hangar
- 11 space. Anything else?
- 12 A. Everything required to run, essentially, an isolated
- 13 | airline out of that base. All maintenance, all crews,
- 14 everything should be self-contained there, yes.
- 15 Q. So you have 24 of those across the country; right?
- 16 A. Correct, yes.
- 17 | Q. And how many aircraft does Allegiant currently have?
- 18 A. Approximately 125.
- 19 Q. Now, if you look at this map and you look at the orange
- 20 dots, what do those orange dots represent?
- 21 A. Those represent what we deem are leisure destinations.
- 22 Q. Are those the major areas of travel for Allegiant?
- 23 A. Generally, traffic would be inbound to the orange dots
- 24 out of the blue dots, but not exclusively, obviously.
- 25 Q. And do you see roughly ten dots just in Florida alone?

- 1 A. That sounds right.
- 2 Q. And that's all the way from -- it's a little too soon
- 3 to -- all the way from Destin to Key West?
- 4 A. Correct.
- 5 THE COURT: Bellingham, Washington, is a leisure
- 6 destination?
- 7 THE WITNESS: We get a fair amount of transborder
- 8 traffic coming down from Vancouver to service that.
- 9 Bellingham is actually one of our oldest cities and is a
- 10 | plane and aircraft base. At one time it was about
- 11 | 12 percent of our total service.
- 12 THE COURT: Thank you.
- 13 | Q. And so of your 24 bases, you have six in Florida alone?
- 14 A. That sounds right, yes.
- 15 Q. And why does Allegiant have so much presence in
- 16 Florida?
- 17 A. We serve a leisure customer and Florida, obviously, is
- 18 a very strong leisure-oriented state.
- 19 Q. So it's a natural extension of your leisure destination
- 20 VFR services -- service offerings?
- 21 A. Certainly, yeah.
- 22 Q. There's also orange dots in a number of larger cities.
- 23 Do you see that?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. Boston, Los Angeles, San Francisco, Las Vegas, New

York, D.C., Baltimore, New Orleans; correct? 1 2 Yes. 3 THE COURT: I don't mean to prolong this. See if 4 you can't do the same as you did for Bellingham with Tulsa. 5 Tulsa, Oklahoma. 6 THE WITNESS: Not nearly as large as Bellingham 7 simply because Vancouver is such a large catchment area of 8 passengers. So Tulsa, probably never more than 2 percent of 9 overall capacity. 10 When you were speaking with the Department of Justice 11 you talked about an evolution in Allegiant's business model. 12 Can you give us a little bit more detail about that 13 evolution? 14 Sure. We started as an airline very much focused on the smallest cities that were generally unserved going to 15 16 Vegas and Orlando, the biggest destinations. In the midpart 17 of last decade, meaning roughly 2013, we started into 18 midsized cities like Austin, Texas. Cincinnati, Ohio 19 followed shortly after that, and a few other midsized 20 2016 was kind of the rival into some of the bigger 21 northeast cities with our Newark announcement, and then that 22 was followed really through 2021 with additions into Boston 23 into Houston, Chicago, cities that Allegiant typically 24 hadn't been in but represented a big opportunity of kind of 25 an underserved demand profile.

```
THE COURT: Ms. Bansal, I'm going to have you stop
 1
 2
     now because we have to go out to Boston University.
 3
               The present elapsed time stands the government,
 4
     five days, twenty-five minutes. The defense, three days,
     two hours, twenty minutes. We'll stand in recess now until
 5
 6
     9:00 a.m. tomorrow morning. We'll start promptly then.
 7
     We'll recess.
 8
               THE CLERK: All rise.
 9
10
               (Proceedings adjourned.)
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

## C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Cheryl B. Palanchian, Court Reporter for the United States District Court for the District of Massachusetts, do hereby certify that the foregoing pages are a true and accurate transcription of my shorthand notes taken in the aforementioned matter to the best of my skill and ability.

/s/ Cheryl B. Palanchian 11/14/2023
CHERYL B. PALANCHIAN

Registered Merit Reporter Certified Realtime Reporter